

8. For each of the following equivalences, determine if it is valid for all predicates P and Q . If yes then give a full explanation. If not then provide a counterexample.

(a) $\exists x(P(x) \vee Q(x)) \equiv \exists xP(x) \vee \exists xQ(x)$

Solution: *True.*

If the LHS is *True* then there is a constant, say, a such that (i) $P(a) = T$, or (ii) $Q(a) = T$. In case (i) $\exists xP(x)$ is *True*, while in case (ii) $\exists xQ(x)$ is *True*, so that in both cases the RHS is *True*,

If the RHS is *True*, then (i) there is a constant, say, a such that $P(a) = T$, so that the LHS is also *True* with $x = a$, or (ii) there is a constant, say, b such that $Q(b) = T$, so that the LHS is also *True* with $x = b$.

(b) $\exists x(P(x) \wedge Q(x)) \equiv \exists xP(x) \wedge \exists xQ(x)$

Solution: *False.*

Suppose $P(a)$ is *True* for some constant a , and *False* for all constants $b \neq a$. Suppose also $Q(b)$ is *True* for some constant b , and *False* for all constants $a \neq b$. Then RHS is *True* and LHS is *False*.

(c) $\forall x\forall y(P(x) \wedge Q(y)) \equiv \forall xP(x) \wedge \forall yQ(y)$

Solution: *True.*

If the RHS is *True* then P is always *True* and Q is always *True*. Then the LHS is also always *True*.

If the RHS is *False* then there is a constant, say a , such that $P(a) = F$, or there is a constant, say b , such that $Q(b) = F$. In the first case $P(a) \wedge Q(a)$ is *False*, and in the second case $P(b) \wedge Q(b)$ is *False*, so in any case the LHS is also *False*.

(d) $\forall x\forall y(P(x) \vee Q(y)) \equiv \forall xP(x) \vee \forall yQ(y)$

Solution: *True.*

If the RHS is *True* then we must consider two cases: (i): P is always *True* or (ii) Q is always *True*. In either case the LHS is *True* also.

If on the other hand the RHS is *False* then there is a constant, say a , such that $P(a) = F$, and there is a constant, say b , such that $Q(b) = F$. Then the LHS is seen to be *False* also, namely by picking $x = a$ and $y = b$.